ISO/IEC JTC1/SC22
Programming languages, their environments and system software interfaces
Secretariat: U.S.A (ANSI)

ISO/IEC JTC1/SC22

N 2122

April 1996

TITLE:	The Normative Referencing of Specifications Other Than International Standards in JTC 1 International Standards - Guidelines for JTC 1 SCs
SOURCE:	Secretariat, ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC22
WORK ITEM:	N/A
STATUS:	N/A
CROSS REFERENCE:	SC22 N2106 (res 13)
DOCUMENT TYPE:	JTC 1 Guidelines Document
ACTION:	To SC22 Member Bodies, Working Group Conveners and HODs for action or information as applicable.

Address reply to: ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC22 Secretariat
William C Rinehuls
8457 Rushing Creek Court
Springfield, VA 22153
Tel: (703) 912-9680   Fax: (703) 912-2973   E-mail: rinehuls@access.digex.net

ISO **IEC** ───────────────────── ISO/IEC JTC 1 N **4046**

DATE: 10 April 1996

ISO/IEC JTC 1 **INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY** **Secretariat: U.S.A. (ANSI)**

TITLE: The Normative Referencing of Specifications other than International Standards in JTC 1 International Standards - Guidelines for JTC 1 SCs-

SOURCE: ISO/IEC JTC 1/WG-RS

PROJECT:

STATUS: In accordance with JTC 1 Sydney Resolution 13 (reference document JTC 1 N 4058), JTC 1 approves a policy that normative referencing from JTC 1 International Standards to documents other than International Standards are permitted, subject to the Guidelines in JTC 1 N 4046. JTC 1 further approves JTC 1 N 4046 for a trial period ending July 1998, after which the applicability and usefulness of the Guidelines should be evaluated. The JTC 1 Secretariat will update the JTC 1 Directives accordingly.

ACTION: This document is circulated to the National Bodies of JTC 1 for information and to the JTC 1 Subcommittees for implementation, as appropriate.

DISTRIBUTION: P and L Members
       SC Secretariats and Chairmen

JTC 1 N 4046

The Normative Referencing of Specifications other than International Standards in JTC 1 International Standards

- Guidelines for JTC 1 SCs-

1996-03-13

Table of contents:

1   Purpose and scope of this Guide

ISO/IEC JTC 1 has defined and implemented a policy that encourages and assists the transposition of certain technical specifications from sources outside JTC 1 into international standards. JTC 1 N 3582 (*The Transposition of Publicly Available Specifications (PAS) into International Standards - A Management Guide*) describes in detail this transposition process.

JTC 1 also recognizes that there may be situations where it is appropriate to reference a specification without performing the transposition process as described in JTC 1 N 3582. This situation may apply in a number of cases. JTC 1 assumes that the procedures and conditions for referencing depend on the process and the kind of international standard (IS or ISP) in which the reference will be established. One of the cases is described in this document, namely where an International Standard (IS) is developed by a JTC 1 Subcommittee, using the 5 stage process. Other cases will be considered later.

JTC 1 re-emphasizes its preference for transposition into international standards as the approach to include material from outside JTC 1. However, if the referencing approach is chosen, it is necessary to establish such references in international standards in a consistent way which ensures the quality of international standards established by JTC 1 as well as the proper treatment of IPR issues. Therefore, a process has to be defined by JTC 1 for the establishment of references to documents other than from ISO, IEC or ITU.

JTC 1 SCs may, in the course of their work, find it appropriate to incorporate specifications into an emerging IS by way of reference. The need for such action, the selection of the appropriate specification, and the evaluation of the proposed Referenced Specification (RS) itself are matters for the SC to determine. Any such SC decision will, however, be subject to JTC 1 National Body evaluation during the respective ballot.

As no restrictions apply to making informative references (see ISO/IEC Directives Part 3), the scope of this document is limited to the normative referencing of a specification other than from ISO, IEC or ITU in an international standard.

These Guidelines provide insights to facilitate the SC consideration and subsequent incorporation of an RS into a JTC 1 IS. Since the consideration of a proposed RS may well involve more than purely technical considerations, it is deemed helpful to provide these Guidelines. The SC is asked to use this document to facilitate the process. As to IPR issues or organizational matters, it is expected that the SC will contact the appropriate bodies (e.g. ITTF) to obtain the necessary information and that the SC will, if necessary, facilitate discussion between ISO/IEC and the RS Originator.

2   JTC 1 approach to referencing other specifications

According to ISO/IEC rules, referencing sources other than ISO, IEC, or ITU is a valid approach for making use of such specifications, provided JTC 1 deems it appropriate. While JTC 1 supports this approach, it has to maintain the quality of its work and the integrity of the standards development process. Therefore, it is necessary to establish some referencing rules that complement those of ISO/IEC. Though rules and guidelines are important, JTC 1 wishes them to be as straightforward as possible. This also takes account of the fact that the initiative for establishing references usually comes from the standards developing

community within JTC 1. Further, no undue burden should be put on the originator of a specification being referenced.

3   Terms for normative references to other specifications

The process of establishing normative references to documents other than from ISO, IEC or ITU is based on the ISO/IEC Directives and the JTC 1 Directives with the addition of the following terms:

- Referenced Specification (RS)
  A specification from a source other than ISO, IEC, or ITU is called a Referenced Specification (RS) if it meets certain criteria (see Section 6) and has been balloted and accepted together with the DIS at the JTC 1 National Body level as suitable for normative referencing in the resulting international standard (IS). An RS may be a part of a larger specification.

- RS Originator
  The originator of an RS or a proposed RS is called an RS Originator.

4   Principles for referencing of specifications

4.1   An RS shall be within the JTC 1 scope.

4.2   Concerning conformity and interoperability, ISs containing normative references to other specifications have to follow the same requirements and rules as for other JTC 1 standards as defined in the JTC 1 Directives.

   Temporary note:The inclusion of the interoperability aspect in this clause is based on the assumption that the interoperabilty ballot to amend the JTC 1 Directives will pass.

4.3   When the referencing specification (CD or DIS) is submitted for ballot it shall be accompanied by a Referencing Explanatory Report (RER) which has been generated by the SC wishing to incorporate the RS in a target IS.

4.4   The RER shall contain the following elements:

4.4.1   a justification for the referencing which shall also address the following aspects:
- relationship of the proposed RS to existing or emerging international standards (and regional or other standards as appropriate) and when the RS is competing with or complementing an existing or emerging international standard, the rationale for the referencing;
- the degree of market acceptance of the proposed RS; and
- the rationale as to why the transposition of the proposed RS into an IS is inappropriate or impractical,

4.4.2   statements that address the criteria as detailed in section 6.

4.5   The material submitted for ballot shall include a copy of the proposed RS. If the referenced material has been made available to JTC 1 member bodies previously as an N-numbered document, it is acceptable, instead, to refer to this document.

4.6 ·   For actual referencing, the rules of the ISO/IEC Directives apply. In particular, any re-
ference shall be specific and indicate the publication date and/or version number as
appropriate.

4.7   If an RS, in turn, contains a normative reference to a specification other than an
international standard, the information required by an RER shall normally be provided
for each additional reference. The exception to this requirement is when the level of
detail involved would be so time-consuming to assemble, and difficult to interpret, that
its collection would be counter-productive. In this case, the SC shall explain the
situation in a way that will enable National Bodies to make an informed assessment of
the references that are being made. The responsible SC is expected to thoroughly
process all nested references.

5   Description of the process for JTC 1 Subcommittee use

5.1   Announcement of intent to make reference

The intent to make a normative reference to a specification other than an international
standard should be stated in the New Work Item Proposal (NP) if the requirement is known
at that time; otherwise, the intent should be communicated to JTC 1 National Bodies as
soon as consensus on the need is reached in the SC.

5.2   Preparation of the Referencing Explanatory Report

It is the obligation of the JTC 1 Subcommittee which develops an IS containing normative
references to specifications other than international standards, to provide for each proposed
RS a related RER. The elements of this Report are described in clause 4.4 above. In order
to avoid any undue delay in the standard ratification process and to avoid the wasting of de-
velopment resources, the production of a RER should commence as soon as the standard
developing Subcommittee has determined the need to establish a normative reference.

The degree to which a cooperative arrangement is established between the standard de-
veloping organization and the RS Originator may vary, and is not prescribed by JTC 1. How-
ever, since some elements of the RER require final endorsement by the RS Originator, it is
recommended that a contact be established with the RS Originator as early as possible to
explore its willingness to accept the referencing.

5.3   Availability of the Referencing Explanatory Report

The RER shall be made available to JTC 1 and its National Bodies as early as possible and
appropriate. The latest date for the availability of the Report is the submission of the first
CD. The RER shall also accompany any subsequent CD and DIS ballot.

5.4   Ballot

The material submitted for ballot (CD and DIS) shall include the RER together with a copy of
the proposed RS. If the Report or the proposed RS have already been provided earlier, it is
acceptable to give, instead, a reference to the earlier submission and a statement verifying
that no changes have occured in the meantime.

In the case of a CD ballot, JTC 1 National Bodies are invited to independently submit their comments on the RER by the time the CD ballot closes, for review by the relevant SC.

Comments and votes are handled in the usual way. The RS Originator shall be invited to attend the appropriate part of any resolution meeting held.

5.5   Publication of the standard

No particular provisions regarding publication apply where an IS contains a reference to an RS. The source of the RS may be different from that of an IS, and it is not required that the text of the RS should be published, or distributed, with the referencing standard.

5.6   Maintenance

It is expected that JTC 1 will evaluate the consequences of any change to the RS subsequent to its inclusion as a reference in a JTC 1 standard, for appropriate action (e.g. revision, exclusion).

5.7   Documentation requirements

Further to the requirements in the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 3, all RSs to which a normative reference is made, should be identified in a subclause of clause 2 of the IS. This subclause should start with the following text:

> *All references in this subclause were correct at the time of approval of this International Standard. The provisions of the referenced specifications, as identified in this subclause, are valid within the context of this IS. The reference to a specification within this IS does not give it any further status within ISO/IEC; in particular, it does not give the referenced specification the status of an International Standard.*

6   Evaluation of a proposed RS

6.1   Introduction

JTC 1 has established criteria which serve as a basis for the judgement as to whether a particular specification can be accepted as a normative reference in an international standard. This judgement initially occurs at JTC 1 Subcommittee level when a decision to establish a normative reference is made, and later at NB level during the CD or DIS ballot.

JTC 1 considers that the primary benefit of these criteria is guidance for consistent evaluation rather than an absolute pass/fail mechanism. There is a wide variety of specifications available for consideration as well as a wide variety of needs within the JTC 1 community. An absolute pass/fail mechanism over such a wide variety of material is unlikely. What is needed throughout this process is flexibility and good judgement on the part of all concerned. Rather than provide quantitative measures to evaluate acceptability of a proposed RS on a pass/ fail basis, the criteria set forth the key topics for consideration and measures for evaluating them in terms of the scope, depth, and thoroughness with which the criteria topics have been considered.

6.2   Supplementary elements

It is intended that the questions asked under each Criteria Category are to be viewed as examples of ways in which the basic criteria sub-category might be evaluated. There may well be other responses to unasked questions that best describe how well a given proposed RS meets, for example, an acceptable level of "Quality". In general, the more complete the RER and its accompanying documents, the easier it will be for JTC 1 National Bodies to evaluate an international standard making a normative reference to an RS.

6.3   Criteria

6.3.1 Cooperative stance

On initiative of the SC, the RS Originator shall provide or acknowledge a written statement that it agrees to the referencing of a specific document or family of documents in a JTC 1 standard. An applicable prior written statement may be used. Should the RS Originator decline to provide or acknowledge such a statement, the reference shall not be made.

There shall be comprehensive statements covering the following categories and topics:

6.3.1.1 Ongoing maintenance:
Who is responsible for maintenance of the RS if and when the need arises?

6.3.1.2 Changes:
What is the flexibility of the RS Originator to apply changes to the RS if so requested during the process of balloting the referencing standard?

6.3.1.3 Availability of the referenced specification
What is the status of public availability of the RS on fair, reasonable and non-discriminatory terms and conditions?

Is the RS Originator willing to notify JTC 1 in a timely manner of any intention to terminate the availability of the RS?

6.3.2 Intellectual property rights

It is the SC's responsibility to ensure that statements in response to 6.3.2.1 - 6.3.2.3 are provided in the RER. The RS Originator is requested, in the strongest terms, to make known in writing its position on the items listed below.

6.3.2.1 Patents:
What is the status of meeting the ISO/IEC policy on patent matters?

6.3.2.2 Copyrights:
What copyrights exist, and what copyrights is the RS Originator willing to grant, throughout both the evaluation and the publication cycle?

6.3.2.3 Trademark rights:
What trademarks apply to the RS and with what conditions?

6.3.3 Quality

The SC shall establish that the proposed RS is of adequate quality, considering topics such as the length of the time the specification has existed, whether products have been implemented using it, whether conformance requirements are clear, and whether the specification is readily and widely available.